

**3.1 Deputy R.G. Le Hérisier of St. Saviour of the Minister for Planning and Environment regarding pre-application advice given in respect of removing Field 528, St. Saviour from the Green Zone:**

What pre-application advice, if any, was given by the Minister and/or the department in respect of removing Field 528, St. Saviour from the green zone?

**Senator F.E. Cohen (The Minister for Planning and Environment):**

The pre-application advice relating to Field 528, St. Saviour, consisted of 2 pre-application meetings and a letter. Two meetings were requested by the Rotary Club to introduce its concept of relocating the Good Companions Club. While my department is supportive of providing assistance to the Good Companions Club it is clear that this particular site is a Countryside Zone and proposed Green Zone in the new Island Plan, and will require a States debate if it were to be rezoned. During those meetings it became clear that any proposals to develop the site would be contrary to the Island Plan and the Draft Island Plan. Written formal advice was given to the Rotary Club regarding the relocation of the Good Companions Club by the department in a letter of 21st March this year. This letter advised the Rotary Club of the current zoning. The advice indicated that in these circumstances if an application was received for development it would be a departure from the Island Plan, and consideration of an application would likely result in a public inquiry. I conclude by saying that I will do everything I can to help the Good Companions Club find a new home.

**3.1.1 Deputy R.G. Le Hérisier:**

I thank the Minister for that answer. Could the Minister confirm that no oral advice was given, or if it was given, a note was taken to that effect? Would he also confirm that the Club was told in very strong terms that the chances of approval, given the procedures outlined, were likely to be very, very slim?

**Senator F.E. Cohen:**

All meetings with the Good Companions Club were with officers present and formal notes were taken and there is a record of those meetings. It was made clear to the Good Companions Club, as I have stated in my answer, that we regarded this as an application that was going to be contentious. While we were supportive of the principle of helping the Good Companions Club it was always made clear that this would likely result in a public inquiry and if the rezoning was to be taken forward it would be the subject of a States debate.

**3.1.2 Deputy J.A. Hilton of St. Helier:**

Can the Minister tell Members whether he has engaged in dialogue with the owner/developers of land rezoned in 2008 in St. Saviour to try and help Rotary establish a centre that they are trying to do. That land was rezoned for the sole purpose of providing senior citizens' accommodation.

**Senator F.E. Cohen:**

We are referring here of course to what is known generally as the Carter site, and I would dearly like to do as the Deputy has suggested, but it would not be appropriate as Minister for Planning and Environment for me to negotiate an arrangement between the Good Companions Club and the owners and developers of what we know

as the Carter site. However, I believe that another Minister is taking that matter forward.

**3.1.3 Senator J.L. Perchard:**

Does the Minister recall informing the States Assembly some while ago that he would be sympathetic to any planning application within a Parish envelope brought forward by the Constable of the Parish? Will he please advise the Assembly as to exactly what he meant by “the Constable”? Did he mean the Constable as the individual or the Constable as a representative of his community?

**Senator F.E. Cohen:**

I think what I said was that large applications for the rezoning of land for housing would, in most cases, be expected to have the enthusiastic support of the Connétable. Just because the Connétable wishes a particular planning decision to be made does not mean that it has to be made in the direction the Connétable wishes it to be made. But, of course, always the views of the Connétable - and indeed the Deputies of the Parish - are a most important matter in any planning application.

**3.1.4 Senator J.L. Perchard:**

Would the Minister then perhaps kindly consider rephrasing his advice to States Members and that he would be sympathetic to giving support to an application within the Parish envelope if it had the support of the Parish?

**Senator F.E. Cohen:**

Another, of course, important matter is the support of the Parish. The question is how does one ascertain whether the Parish is supportive of an application? That, in my view, must be through the views of the Connétable and the Parish Deputies. I am perfectly happy to dig out the previous comments that I have made in relation to this matter to review them, to alter and clarify them, if necessary, and circulate them to Members.

**3.1.5 Deputy G.P. Southern of St. Helier:**

Does the Minister not accept that it is a perfectly simple matter to call a Parish Assembly and ascertain the depth or level of support for any development?

**Senator F.E. Cohen:**

As the Deputy knows perfectly well, it is not up to the Minister for Planning and Environment to call Parish Assemblies.

**3.1.6 Deputy J.A. Martin of St. Helier:**

Would the Minister for Planning and Environment overall not admit now that it was a very silly decision he made when he said: “I will only put things into this zone and that zone” if he has agreement with Constables because we are doing the hokey-cokey. Some Constables agree, and some Constables do not. Absolutely ridiculous. Will he not now agree?

**Senator F.E. Cohen:**

I am not particularly good at the hokey-cokey but [Laughter] what I will say is that I was very clear in relation to my clarification on this matter, and I am more than happy to circulate what I said to Members probably later in the day.

**Deputy P.V.F. Le Claire of St. Helier:**

A point of order, if I might, the Minister did circulate in comments to all States Members ahead of a previous debate this year the legal advice he had received outlining his position, and that is available on the website. He has stated to us that he has to take into consideration under the Planning Law all matters, not just those of the Constable.

**3.1.7 Connétable P.F.M. Hanning of St. Saviour:**

As we are dealing with this Field 528, would the Minister not agree that, as we have had a Parish Assembly, the result of that Assembly was very clear, and I had said at that Assembly that I would carry forward the view of that Assembly to the Minister; would he please bear that in mind should this ever come before him again?

**Senator F.E. Cohen:**

There is not currently an application on this site, and if there was to be an application I think it is probable that it would be dealt with by the Planning Applications Panel.  
[Laughter]

**The Bailiff:**

Some subtle delegation there, Minister, I think, is there?

**Senator F.E. Cohen:**

No, Sir.